

Evaluation Guidelines for GIPS

The contained evaluation information will be effective for the 2024 International Conference.

The Global Issues Problem Solving (GIPS) Evaluation Guidelines are designed to present the scoring process for GIPS booklets for evaluators, coaches, and participants. Evaluation is performance-based, and evaluation is an authentic assessment of student work. Because there is no single “right” answer, FPSPi employs a variety of strategies to review student work, using specific criteria to evaluate performance in each Step of the process. The goal of the Evaluation Guidelines is to provide a fair, consistent, and reliable method for scoring GIPS booklets. Additional information for evaluators including feedback strategies, scoring examples, and expanded explanations can be found in “Best Practices for GIPS Evaluation”.

Score sheet images are included in this document to provide rubric descriptors.
Actual score sheet formatting may vary.

FLEXIBILITY

Flexibility in thinking is demonstrated by exploring Challenges and Solutions from different perspectives or categories. Only Relevant Challenges and Solutions are assigned a category for Flexibility. One Point each is awarded for up to 16 unique categories assigned. Flexibility is scored in the same manner in Steps 1 and 3.

Below are general descriptions of the categories used for scoring Flexibility. This is by no means an exhaustive explanation of them, but rather is designed to assist in understanding a range of concepts. Each bullet point represents one category, though it may contain more than one concept.

- **Arts** include expression via music, painting, sculpture, theatre, film, or other creative media. **Aesthetics** focuses upon beauty and whether something is pleasant to view or experience.
- **Basic Needs** include food, clothing and shelter—elements important for survival.
- **Business** includes retail stores, restaurants, offices, corporations, etc. **Commerce** focuses upon the trade or the buying and selling of goods and services.
- **Communication** deals with the exchange of information.
- **Culture** includes the customs, arts, social institutions, and achievements of a particular group. **Religion** includes a system of faith or worship.
- **Defense** involves protection, safety, security, and/or privacy. This includes physical efforts by individuals, or groups as well as protection provided by firewalls and passwords.
- **Economics** is the branch of knowledge that concerns the distribution, production, and consumption of wealth.
- **Education** includes schools, training, instruction, and learning.
- **Government** deals with how a community or country is managed. **Politics** involves elections and/or the activities related to making governmental decisions, especially debates or conflicts among individuals or parties having or hoping to achieve power.
- **Law** includes the creation and enforcement of recognized laws, court procedures, sentencing, and personnel. **Justice** is the seeking of fairness and reasonable implementation of laws.
- **Miscellaneous 1** is assigned when an idea does not fit within another defined category within that step. It will count as an additional category for scoring purposes.
- **Miscellaneous 2** is assigned when an idea does not fit within another defined category and is also unrelated to the idea assigned to Miscellaneous 1 within that step. It will count as an additional category for scoring purposes.
- **Physical Health** deals with the condition and care of the body as opposed to the mind.
- **Psychological Health** focuses upon emotional and mental well-being.
- **Recreation** includes hobbies, sports, entertainment, and other activities pursued during leisure time.
- **Science** is the systematic study of the structure and behavior of the physical and natural world (including the wider universe) through observation and experiment.

- **Environment** includes one’s surroundings or conditions that shape the lives of people, plants, or animals.
- **Ethics** include the principles that govern a person’s behavior. **Morality** involves principles concerning the distinction between right and wrong.
- **Social Relationships** encompass the connections between individuals with recurring interactions.
- **Technology** is associated with machines, equipment, and/or certain advancements developed from applying practical or scientific knowledge.
- **Transportation** is concerned with the movement of individuals, groups, or goods from place to place.

FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS

Fundamental Concepts for FPS include Research, Creativity and Futurism. Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking are scored in the same manner in Steps 1, 3, and 6. Each step is scored independently of the others, based on the work submitted within the step under consideration. All work provided in a step, whether scored Relevant or not, should be considered for determining the scores for Fundamental Concepts.

Research Applied – 1-5 points

- Uses appropriate research and demonstrates knowledge of future issues and trends as related to the Future Scene. Indications of Research Applied include vocabulary terms, concepts, facts, and incidents from the research.

	Developing		Very Good		Exemplary
RESEARCH APPLIED Uses appropriate research and shows knowledge of issues and trends as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or no evidence of research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends		Some evidence of relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends		Integrates in-depth, relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends
	1	2	3	4	5

Creative Strength – 1-5 points

- Skillfully uses productive, creative, and innovative thinking. Responses showing Creative Strength are those requiring intellectual energy to make mental leaps beyond obvious or commonplace responses.

	Developing		Very Good		Exemplary
CREATIVE STRENGTH Skillfully uses productive, clever, and innovative thinking	Includes minimal evidence of creative thinking		Some evidence of creative thinking; goes beyond the norm at times		Integrates innovative and/or insightful ideas that go beyond the ordinary
	1	2	3	4	5

Futuristic Thinking – 1-5 points

- Utilizes knowledge of future issues and time frame as related to the Future Scene. Futuristic Thinking is demonstrated by addressing and extrapolating relevant trends and technologies from their research to the Future Scene as they identify futuristic, workable ideas, and how they could impact future society.

	Developing		Very Good		Exemplary
FUTURISTIC THINKING Utilizes knowledge of future trends and predictions as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or unrelated evidence of trends or technology		Some evidence of futuristic ideas; goes beyond the norms at times		Integrates purposeful, futuristic concepts, showing how ideas impact the future
	1	2	3	4	5

NOTE: Only if no student work is submitted for a step, will a score of 0 be given for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking within that step.

STEP 1 – Identify Challenges

A Challenge is an issue, concern, or problem that *may* need attention or consideration. A Challenge is a logical cause or effect emerging from the events in the Future Scene that may have a chance of occurring. In addition, Challenges should be written as possibilities since the future is uncertain.

1. Challenges are scored for Fluency.
2. Relevant Challenges are assigned a category for Flexibility.
3. Relevant Challenges are considered for their degree of Clarity + Insight.
4. Relevant Challenges are considered for Originality.
5. The step as a whole is scored for Fundamental Concepts.

1. **FLUENCY** – Once a response is scored Relevant, it will be considered for Flexibility, Clarity, Insight, and Originality. Challenges are scored using the following Fluency options:

- **Relevant** – 1 point for each
 - Challenge has a possibility of existing within the context of the assigned FS. It does not need to have a high probability of occurring, but a logical possibility.
 - Students must demonstrate this connection to the Future Scene.

NOTES:

- ✓ **Relevant** Challenges can be written at different levels of expertise. The emphasis is on the Challenge *idea*, not the sophistication of the *writing*.
- ✓ Challenges not written using “may,” “might,” or similar language are considered for Relevancy only. (Zero points for Clarity and Insight)
- ✓ Cause-effect reasoning is not required for a Relevant score. Cause-effect logic is considered under “Clarity.”
- **Maybe** – 0 points awarded
 - Challenge idea needs targeted/specific information to be considered Relevant.
 - Challenge is ambiguous or intent is not clear.
- **Not Relevant** – 0 points awarded
 - Challenge is not related to the Future Scene.
- **Duplicate** – 0 points awarded
 - Any Challenge idea that is too contextually similar to another **Relevant** Challenge.
- NOTE:
 - ✓ Duplicate Challenge ideas are not the same as a repeated category.
- **Solution** – 0 points awarded
 - A response that offers a solution to a concern from the Future Scene.
- **Blank** – 0 points awarded
 - No student response provided

FLUENCY (idea itself)

- R - Relevant – Challenge has a possibility of existing within the context of the assigned FS. (1 point)
- M - Maybe – Challenge idea needs additional information to be considered Relevant. (0 point)
- NR - Not Relevant - Challenge idea is not related to the Future Scene. (0 point)
- D - Duplicate – Challenge idea is too contextually similar to a Relevant Challenge. (0 point)
- S - Solution – A response that offers a solution to a concern from the Future Scene. (0 point)
- B - Blank - No student response provided. (0 point)

2. **FLEXIBILITY** - All Relevant Challenges are assigned a category (see page 1).

- Categories – 1 point each for up to 16 unique categories (8 for Individual booklets)

FLEXIBILITY		
1 point for each unique category used		
1. Arts & Aesthetics	8. Education	15. Physical Health
2. Basic Needs	9. Environment	16. Psychological Health
3. Business & Commerce	10. Ethics & Morality	17. Recreation
4. Communication	11. Government & Politics	18. Science
5. Culture & Religion	12. Law & Justice	19. Social Relationships
6. Defense	13. Miscellaneous 1	20. Technology
7. Economics	14. Miscellaneous 2	21. Transportation

3. **CLARITY + INSIGHT** - Clarity + Insight considers the development of a Relevant Challenge idea, and the quality of thinking provided. Only Relevant Challenges are considered for Clarity. Then, only Challenges receiving credit for Clarity are eligible to receive credit for Insight. Each Relevant Challenge can earn 0 (NA), 1 (Clarity), or 2 points (1 for Clarity and 1 for Insight).

- **Not applicable** – 0 points
 - Challenge is not developed beyond the requirements needed to be considered Relevant. Thus, it receives no points for Clarity or Insight.
- **Clarity** – 1 point – Measures the *quality* of the writing and the cause-effect reasoning in the Challenges.
 - A clearly written Challenge demonstrates effective communication of the cause/effect reasoning presented. Only relevant challenges are considered for Clarity.
- **Insight** – 1 point – Measures understanding of Challenge consequences with strong and logical cause and effect reasoning. Only Relevant challenges with Clarity point are considered for Insight.
 - An Insightful Challenge demonstrates meaningful, in-depth understanding of potential implications emerging from the Future Scene:
 - a. Ideas that are fully developed; contain definite consequences rather than vague or extreme statements such as “cause other problems” or “everyone will die.”
 - b. Ideas that offer thoughtful analysis.
 - c. Ideas that are elevated with robust understanding.
 - d. Ideas that present strong and logical cause and effect reasoning.

<p>CLARITY + INSIGHT (development of ideas marked Relevant)</p> <p>NA - Not Applicable – Challenge not developed beyond requirements of Relevant (0 point)</p> <p>C - Clarity – A clearly written Challenge demonstrates effective communication of the cause/effect reasoning presented. (1 point)</p> <p>C+I - Clarity +Insight – receives Clarity, and demonstrates meaningful, in-depth understanding of potential implications emerging from the Future Scene. (2 points)</p>

NOTES:

- ✓ Not Applicable means it was scored as Relevant, but it did not explain the cause-effect relationship.
- ✓ Clarity means it was scored as Relevant, and there is a clear cause-effect relationship indicated.
- ✓ Clarity + Insight means it was scored as Relevant, and there is a cause-effect relationship (clarity), as well as additional insight into the events of the Future Scene in at least one of the ways numbered above.

4. **ORIGINALITY** – 1 point for each instance (limit of 5)

- Only Relevant Challenge ideas are considered for Originality.
- Challenges do not need to receive points for Clarity and Insight to be considered for Originality.

- An infrequent Challenge idea that demonstrates breakthrough thinking or is highly creative, futuristic, and/or unique. Original ideas are those that go beyond the obvious and thus appear in less than 2% of Challenge ideas for that division.

ORIGINALITY (rare degree of uniqueness of ideas marked Relevant)
 O - Original – An infrequent Challenge idea that demonstrates breakthrough thinking, or is highly creative, futuristic, and/or unique. (1 point)

NOTE:

- ✓ Wildly futuristic ideas are not always original.

5. **FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS** - Step 1 as a whole is scored for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking (see page 2).

	Developing	Very Good	Exemplary
RESEARCH APPLIED Uses appropriate research and shows knowledge of issues and trends as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or no evidence of research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends	Some evidence of relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends	Integrates in-depth, relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends
	1 2	3 4	5
CREATIVE STRENGTH Skillfully uses productive, clever, and innovative thinking	Includes minimal evidence of creative thinking	Some evidence of creative thinking; goes beyond the norm at times	Integrates innovative and/or insightful ideas that go beyond the ordinary
	1 2	3 4	5
FUTURISTIC THINKING Utilizes knowledge of future trends and predictions as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or unrelated evidence of trends or technology	Some evidence of futuristic ideas; goes beyond the norms at times	Integrates purposeful, futuristic concepts, showing how ideas impact the future
	1 2	3 4	5

Evaluation of Common Errors in Challenges

- ❖ Challenges written in definite terms (such as will or would) may receive a Relevant score but should not be considered for Clarity + Insight.
- ❖ Challenge contains two or more possible Challenge ideas. Score the first Challenge idea for determining Relevance. In consideration of Clarity + Insight, all the information provided must be considered. It is unlikely that the combination of multiple ideas would warrant it receiving credit for Clarity.

NOTE:

- ✓ If no work is submitted for the step, a score of 0 will be given for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking.
- ✓ If no student response is provided for any Challenge, the entire step receives 0 points.

STEP 2 – Select an Underlying Problem

An Underlying Problem identifies a goal based on addressing one or more Challenge(s) within the Future Scene in response to the charge. An excellent Underlying Problem has a narrowed focus, addresses a **significant** issue from the Future Scene through the Key Verb Phrase, and identifies a positive outcome (Purpose) of accomplishing the Key Verb Phrase.

An Underlying Problem is scored in four areas:

1. Structure
2. Significance
3. Scope
4. Clarity

1. STRUCTURE

Condition Phrase (CP) – 0, 2, 4, 6 points

- The Condition Phrase provides the reason why the KVP and Purpose have been selected.
- Based on facts from the Future Scene or research related to the Future Scene

Condition Phrase (CP) Provides a rationale for the issue chosen for the UP	CP is missing	CP contains inaccurate or unrelated information	CP contains accurate information, but does not provide rationale for selected KVP and Purpose	CP contains accurate information logically establishing the UP
	0	2	4	6

Stem

- Introduction to Key Verb Phrase such as “How might we....” or “In what ways might we...” or other appropriate lead in phrase.

Key Verb Phrase (KVP) – 0, 2, 4, 6 points

- The Key Verb Phrase uses a single action verb or verb phrase to identify the goal to address an issue from the Future Scene.

NOTE:

- ✓ Step 3 Solution ideas must address all actions/goals presented in the Key Verb Phrase.

Key Verb Phrase (KVP) Provides a single-action verb phrase that identifies the goal for Step 3 Solutions	KVP is missing	Present but has multiple verbs	Present but has multiple objects or modifiers	Present and contains a single-action verb
	0	2	4	6

Purpose (P) – 0, 2, 4, 6 points

- The Purpose should be singular and provide the reason why pursuing the KVP is important. It should be a logical outcome of the KVP.

Purpose (P) Provides a reason why pursuing the KVP is important	Purpose not present	Present but more than one or repeats KVP	Present but not clear relationship to KVP	Present and singular with logical relation to KVP
	0	2	4	6

NOTE:

- ✓ The Purpose often begins with “so,” “so that,” “such that”, or “in order to.”

Evaluation of a booklet without a Purpose

- ❖ A UP that has no Purpose receives a 1-1 for Significance and Scope.
- ❖ **In non-competitive rounds**, if the UP has no Purpose, one will be imposed for the sake of offering feedback on Solutions.
- ❖ **In competitive rounds**, if the UP does not have a Purpose, one will not be imposed, and solutions will not be scored for Fluency. They will be scored only for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking.

Future Scene Parameters (FSP) – (0, 2, 4, 6 points)

- These parameters include the topic, place, and time as determined by the Future Scene situation.

FS Parameters (FSP)	0 Parameters present	1 Parameter present	2 Parameters present	3 Parameters present
Topic, Time, and Place of the Future Scene	0	2	4	6

NOTES:

- ✓ Parameters guide student thinking to operate within the Future Scene.
- ✓ If incorrect parameters are included in the UP, Step 3 will **still** be scored according to the FSP established by the Future Scene.

2. SIGNIFICANCE – 2-20 (Even) points (Critical Error - 1 point)

- Significance assesses the **importance** of the Underlying Problem to the Future Scene.
 - The Underlying Problem should identify an important issue from the Future Scene and be connected to the charge.
 - The Underlying Problem should reflect a concern identified in Step 1.
 - The Underlying Problem should establish an objective for Step 3.

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Significance Assesses the importance of the UP to the Future Scene charge	Critical Error	Identifies minor issue from the FS	Identifies an appropriate issue related to the FS charge	Identifies an important issue related to the FS charge with a meaningful connection to the topic
	1			
	Weak relationship to FS, topic and charge			
	2 4 6	8 10 12	14 16	18 20

Evaluation of a booklet with multiple KVPs or multiple Purposes
 ❖ If there is a multiple KVP or Purpose, only the first one is considered when scoring Significance, though all must be addressed in each Solution.

3. SCOPE – 2-20 (Even) points (Critical Error -1 point)

- Scope measures the extent to which the UP is manageable.
 - The issue identified in the Underlying Problem should be a smaller part of the Future Scene.
 - The issue identified in the Underlying Problem should be large enough to impact the Future Scene but also be attainable.

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Scope Measures the manageability and focus of the UP	Critical Error	UP so broad or narrow that it is unlikely to be attainable or effective	Consideration given to focus and manageability; impact may be limited	Identifies a small enough segment of the FS to be manageable but sizeable enough to be impactful
	1			
	Weak relationship to FS, topic and charge			
	2 4 6	8 10 12	14 16	18 20

4. CLARITY – 2-20 (Even) points

- Clarity examines effective communication of the goal of the UP.
 - The Condition Phrase identifies a significant issue from the Future Scene.
 - The KVP presents what solutions should strive to accomplish in a way that is easy to understand.
 - The Purpose should effectively indicate the reason for accomplishing the KVP.
 - The CP, KVP, and Purpose should logically lead one into another.

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Clarity Examines effective communication of the intent of the UP	Difficult to determine intent of UP	Action to be taken (KVP) is vague; intent of UP unclear	Effort made to clearly define action and explain its importance	UP clearly defines action and communicates effectively its importance
	2 4 6	8 10 12	14 16	18 20

Evaluation of a booklet with multiple KVPs or multiple Purposes

- ❖ If there is a multiple KVP or Purpose
 - The Scope score will be reduced, and evaluators will use only the first verb/verb phrase or Purpose when scoring for Significance.
 - The Clarity score should fall within the Proficient or Developing range.
 - When scoring Solution ideas, all elements must be addressed to receive credit.

Critical Errors

- ❖ A UP that does not contain a Key Verb Phrase receives a 1-1 for Significance and Scope and a 2 for Clarity.
- ❖ A UP that does not contain a Purpose receives a 1-1 for Significance and Scope and a 2 for Clarity.
- ❖ A UP must contain a substantive connection to the Topic **and** Future Scene. If not, it receives a 1-1 for Significance and Scope and a Developing score for Clarity.
- ❖ A UP that negates the concept of the Future Scene receives a 1-1 for Significance and Scope and a Developing Score for Clarity
- ❖ If the Purpose repeats the KVP, the Purpose receives 2 points in structure, a 1-1 for Significance and Scope, and a 2 for Clarity.

During competitive rounds, if a Critical Errors occurs, booklets are ineligible to advance to the next round.

If no student response is provided, the entire step receives 0 points.

STEP 3 – Produce Solutions Ideas

A Solution is an action idea that addresses the Key Verb Phrase, clearly supports the Purpose, and functions within the Future Scene Parameters of Topic, Place, and Time.

1. Solutions are scored for Fluency.
2. Relevant Solutions are assigned a category for Flexibility.
3. Relevant Solutions are considered for their degree of Elaboration + Clarity.
4. Relevant Solutions are considered for Originality.
5. The step as a whole is scored for Fundamental Concepts.

1. **FLUENCY** – Once a response is scored Relevant, it will be considered for Flexibility, Elaboration, Clarity, and Originality. Solutions are scored using the following Fluency options:
 - **Relevant** – 1 point for each
 - States what action will be taken
 - Solution idea addresses the Key Verb Phrase and clearly supports the Purpose implicitly or explicitly.
 - Solution idea must operate within context of the Future Scene.
 - **Maybe** – 0 points awarded
 - Solution ideas that need additional information to be considered Relevant. At least one of the following describes the Solution:
 - Solution is ambiguous or intent is not clear

- Key Verb Phrase not addressed
- Purpose not supported

Evaluation of a booklet without a Purpose

❖ **In competitive rounds**, if the UP does not have a Purpose, Solutions will be scored as Maybe for Fluency. They must all be read and the step will be scored only for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking.

- **Not Relevant** – 0 points awarded
 - At least one of the following describes the Solution:
 - Solution idea does not address both the KVP and the Purpose
 - Solution idea inconsistent with the Future Scene
 - Solution idea does not operate within the Future Scene Parameters
- **Duplicate** – 0 points awarded
 - Any Solution idea in which the **action** is too similar to another Relevant Solution.
NOTE:
✓ Duplicate Solution ideas are not the same as a repeated category.
- **Blank** – 0 points awarded
 - No student response provided

FLUENCY (idea itself)

R - Relevant – Solution idea addresses the Key Verb Phrase and clearly supports the Purpose. (1 point)

M – Maybe – Solution idea that needs additional information to be considered Relevant. (0 point)

NR - Not Relevant – Solution idea needs additional information to be considered Relevant. (0 point)

D - Duplicate – Solution idea is too contextually similar to a Relevant Solution. (0 point)

B - Blank - No student response provided. (0 point)

2. FLEXIBILITY

All Relevant Solutions are assigned a Category (see page 1).

- Categories – 1 point each for up to 16 unique categories (8 for Individual booklets)

FLEXIBILITY		
1 point for each unique category used		
1. Arts & Aesthetics	8. Education	15. Physical Health
2. Basic Needs	9. Environment	16. Psychological Health
3. Business & Commerce	10. Ethics & Morality	17. Recreation
4. Communication	11. Government & Politics	18. Science
5. Culture & Religion	12. Law & Justice	19. Social Relationships
6. Defense	13. Miscellaneous 1	20. Technology
7. Economics	14. Miscellaneous 2	21. Transportation

- 3. ELABORATION + CLARITY - Elaboration + Clarity considers the development of a Relevant Solution idea and the quality of thinking provided. Only Relevant Solutions are considered for Elaboration. Then, only Solutions receiving credit for Elaboration are considered for Clarity. Each Relevant Solution can earn 0 (N/A), 1 (Elaboration), or 2 points (1 for Elaboration and 1 for Clarity).

- **Not applicable** – 0 points
 - Solution is not developed beyond the requirements needed to be considered Relevant. Thus it receives no points for Elaboration or Clarity.
- **Elaboration** – 1 point - includes the additional three elements of who, how, and why.
 1. Who – provides an appropriate person/entity with the power, interest, or expertise to implement the Solution.
 - The name should convey attributes listed above, or additional information is needed.

- The same relevant “who” can receive credit only twice. Repeating the same “who” in additional Solution ideas will not receive credit toward Elaboration.
2. How –indicates the manner in which the Solution will be carried out.
 3. Why – presents a suitable reason for enacting the Solution in terms of one of the following:
 - Why the solution fulfills the KVP
 - Why the solution supports the Purpose
 - Why the solution is effective in solving the UP as a whole

NOTE:

- ✓ A restatement of the UP Purpose is not acceptable.

- **Clarity** – 1 point –Measures the effective communication of the action proposed for Solutions receiving credit for Elaboration. Only Relevant Solutions with Elaboration points are considered for Clarity.

- A Clearly written Solution presents the action and its elaborated details concisely in a manner that is easy to understand.

NOTES:

- ✓ A Relevant Solution whose reasoning is questionable but contains the three elements of Elaboration, should receive a 1 for Elaboration only. (No additional points for Clarity.)
- ✓ Not Applicable means it was scored Relevant, but it did not include the necessary elements for Elaboration.
- ✓ Elaboration means it was scored as Relevant, and the three elements of who, how and why were provided.
- ✓ Elaboration + Clarity means it was scored as Relevant, included who, how and why (elaboration), as well as being effectively communicated.

<p>ELABORATION + CLARITY (development of ideas marked Relevant)</p> <p>NA - Not Applicable – Solution not developed beyond requirements of Relevant. (0 point)</p> <p>E - Elaboration– Solution includes additional three elements of who, how, and why. (1 point)</p> <p>E+C - Elaboration + Clarity – Receives Elaboration, and clearly and concisely demonstrates effective communication of the action proposed. (2 points)</p>
--

4. **ORIGINALITY** – 1 point or each instance (limit of 5)

- Only Relevant Solution ideas are considered for Originality.
- Solutions do not need to receive points for Elaboration + Clarity to be considered for Originality.
- An infrequent Solution idea that demonstrates breakthrough thinking, or is highly creative, futuristic, and/or unique. Original ideas are those that go beyond the obvious and thus appear in less than 2% of Solution ideas for that division.

<p>ORIGINALITY (rare degree of uniqueness of ideas marked Relevant)</p> <p>O - Original – An infrequent Solution idea that demonstrates breakthrough thinking, or is highly creative, futuristic, and/or unique. (1 point)</p>

NOTE:

- ✓ Wildly futuristic ideas are not always original.

5. **FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS** – Step 3 as a whole is scored for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking (see page 2).

	Developing	Very Good	Exemplary
<p>RESEARCH APPLIED</p> <p>Uses appropriate research and shows knowledge of issues and trends as related to the Future Scene</p>	<p>Includes minimal or no evidence of research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends</p>	<p>Some evidence of relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends</p>	<p>Integrates in-depth, relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends</p>
	1 2	3 4	5

CREATIVE STRENGTH Skillfully uses productive, clever, and innovative thinking	Includes minimal evidence of creative thinking	Some evidence of creative thinking; goes beyond the norm at times	Integrates innovative and/or insightful ideas that go beyond the ordinary
	1 2	3 4	5
FUTURISTIC THINKING Utilizes knowledge of future trends and predictions as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or unrelated evidence of trends or technology	Some evidence of futuristic ideas; goes beyond the norms at times	Integrates purposeful, futuristic concepts, showing how ideas impact the future
	1 2	3 4	5

NOTE:

- ✓ If no work is submitted for the step, a score of 0 will be given for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking.
- ✓ If no student response is provided for any Solution, the entire step receives 0 points.

STEP 4 – Generate and Select Criteria

Criteria are the standards by which Solution ideas are compared. Criteria should address aspects of the Solution ideas that will be very important in determining which one will best accomplish the goals of the Underlying Problem.

1. Correctly Written
2. Applicability

1. **CORRECTLY WRITTEN** – A matter of structure

- **Yes** – 2 points each – Each criterion satisfies the following four requirements:
 1. Focuses on a single standard
 2. Demonstrates a measure of degree using a superlative
 3. Indicates the desired outcome
 4. Is recognizable as a question
- **No** – 0 points awarded
 - Does not satisfy all four requirements
- **Blank** – 0 points awarded
 - No student response provided

CORRECTLY WRITTEN is a matter of structure.
 Y - Yes - Meets 4 requirements: single standard, measure of degree, desired outcome, question (2 points)
 N - No - Does not meet all 4 requirements (0 points)
 B - Blank - No student response provided (0 points)

NOTES:

- ✓ Criteria that are written using the words “so that” are not Correctly Written, as they have introduced an additional concept, and are no longer a single dimension.
- ✓ All Criteria, whether Correctly Written or not, are considered for Applicability.

2. **APPLICABILITY** – Measures the usefulness of a Criterion as it applies to the Underlying Problem.

- **Targeted** – 6 points each
 - A Criterion that applies only to the designated UP and is significant in solving the UP
 - Can be based on the Key Verb Phrase
 - Can be based on the Purpose
 - Can be specific in itself to the Underlying Problem
 - Can be specific to topic research that relates to the UP
 - Can be justified with relevant Future Scene facts that relate to the UP

- **Generic** – 3 points each
 - A Criterion that could be applied to nearly any Underlying Problem
 - Simply adding Future Scene Parameters or stakeholders without a connection to the UP is a generic criterion
- **Duplicate** – 0 points awarded
 - Any Criterion idea **too** similar to a Criterion already recognized as Targeted or Generic
- **Not Applicable** – 0 points
 - A Criterion that is not useful for evaluating solutions for this Underlying Problem
- **Blank** – 0 points awarded
 - No student response provided

<p>APPLICABILITY examines the content of each Criterion as applicable to the UP</p> <p>T - Targeted - A Criterion that applies only to the designated UP (6 points)</p> <p>G - Generic - A Criterion that could be applied to nearly any UP (3 points)</p> <p>D - Duplicate - A Criterion concept already presented (0 points)</p> <p>NA - Not Applicable - A Criterion that is not useful for evaluating solutions for this UP (0 points)</p> <p>B - Blank - No student response provided (0 points)</p>
--

STEP 5 – Apply Criteria

In the Evaluation Matrix, Solution ideas are compared against one other for each Criterion. These comparisons determine the Best Solution.

Best Solution = the Solution idea with the highest total (row) in the Evaluation Matrix. The Best Solution may or may not be the highest scoring solution for each Criterion (column) within the Evaluation Matrix.

DETERMINATION OF BEST SOLUTION – Measures the accuracy in completion of the Evaluation Matrix (grid)

- **Accurate Use** - 20 points
 - Matrix contains appropriate numbers in each column, and rows are added correctly. Action Plan is the highest total solution on the matrix.
- **Grid Errors** – 14 points
 - Matrix contains numbering in the wrong direction for the entire grid, uses a number more than once in a column, or presents incorrect addition across a row.
- **Inaccurate Application** - 7 points
 - Matrix displays each row with the same numbers across.
 - Highest-scoring Solution is not used as the basis of the Step 6 Action Plan.
- **Blank** – 0 Points
 - No student response provided

Determination of Best Solution	Inaccurate Application	Grid Errors	Accurate Use
Measures the accuracy in completion of the Evaluation Matrix (grid)	Displaying each row with same number, ignoring problem solving process, solution with highest total is not used as the main focus of the Action Plan, etc.	Errors such as numbering in the wrong direction, repetition of numbers in columns or incorrect addition	Matrix is completed and added correctly
	7	14	20

NOTES:

- ✓ In the event of a tie for the Best Solution, only one can be the basis for the Action Plan. This decision must be addressed in the Discussion of Criteria section of the Action Plan.
- ✓ Students are permitted to weight one Criterion of their choosing. An explanation of this decision must be included in the Discussion of Criteria section of the Action Plan.

STEP 6 – Develop an Action Plan

The Action Plan is based on the best solution identified in Step 5. It provides an expanded discussion of the initial Solution idea presented in Step 3, incorporating relevant additional information to present a detailed proposal for solving the Underlying Problem. Step 6 as a whole is scored for each of the 7 items listed below.

1. Discussion of Criteria
2. Completeness
3. Clarity
4. Relationship to the Underlying Problem
5. Impact on the Future Scene
6. Humaneness
7. Fundamental Concepts

1. DISCUSSION OF CRITERIA– 2-10 (Even) points

Measures the degree to which the criteria are addressed in the Action Plan

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Discussion of Criteria Measures the degree to which the criteria are addressed in the AP	AP does not address the criteria	AP's connection to criteria is minimal or unclear	AP makes some valid connections to criteria	AP addresses criteria in a convincing manner
	2	4	6 8	10

NOTE:

- ✓ Students are encouraged to include the Discussion of Criteria in the first of two boxes provided for the Action Plan. However so long as there is information discussing criteria within Step 6, it must be scored, no matter where it is incorporated.

2. COMPLETENESS – 2-20 (Even) points

Considers the extent to which the Action Plan is thoughtfully elaborated

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Completeness Considers the extent to which the AP is thoughtfully elaborated	Details are minimal; rewrite of Step 3 solution idea	Provides some considerations needed to carry out AP	Contains many elements of AP implementation	Presents organized, comprehensive explanation of process needed to achieve AP
	2 4 6	8 10 12	14 16	18 20

3. CLARITY – 2-10 (Even) points

Examines effective communication of the Action Plan description

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Clarity Measures clearness and conciseness of expression; effective communication of ideas	Overall AP difficult to understand; wordiness confuses main idea or vague, takes leaps in reasoning	Fair; writing inconsistent; may be difficult to understand in places; some wordiness detracts	Good; contains mostly clear and concise descriptions	Excellent; clear, concise expression of ideas throughout AP
	2	4	6 8	10

EVALUATION GUIDELINES FOR GLOBAL ISSUES PROBLEM SOLVING

4. **RELATIONSHIP TO UNDERLYING PROBLEM** – 2-10 (Even) points

- Assesses the extent to which the Action Plan solves the UP

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Relationship to UP Assesses the extent to which the AP solves the UP	AP is unrelated to UP	AP addresses some aspects of UP	AP adequately considers KVP and Purpose of UP	AP effectively responds to KVP and Purpose of UP
	2	4	6 8	10

5. **IMPACT ON FUTURE SCENE** – 2-20 (Even) points

- Measures the positive effect of the Action Plan on the Future Scene situation

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Impact on Future Scene Measures the positive effect of the AP on the Future Scene (FS) situation	Action Plan (AP) has a negative or no impact on FS	AP has minimal positive impact on FS	AP has moderate positive impact on FS	AP has strong positive impact on FS
	2 4 6	8 10 12	14 16	18 20

6. **HUMANENESS** – 2-10 (Even) points

- Measures the productive, positive potential of the Action Plan

	Developing	Proficient	Very Good	Exemplary
Humaneness Measures the productive, positive potential of the AP	Negative or destructive AP	AP is neutral; neither positive nor negative	Constructive potential evident	AP is positive and constructive
	2	4	6 8	10

NOTES:

- ✓ A booklet whose UP has no Purpose should be scored as Developing or Proficient in Relationship to UP.
- ✓ A booklet whose Purpose repeats the KVP should be scored as Developing or Proficient in Relationship to UP.

7. **FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS** – Step 6 as a whole is scored for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking (see page 2).

	Developing	Very Good	Exemplary
RESEARCH APPLIED Uses appropriate research and shows knowledge of issues and trends as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or no evidence of research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends	Some evidence of relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends	Integrates in-depth, relevant research, terms, concepts, issues, and trends
	1 2	3 4	5
CREATIVE STRENGTH Skillfully uses productive, clever, and innovative thinking	Includes minimal evidence of creative thinking	Some evidence of creative thinking; goes beyond the norm at times	Integrates innovative and/or insightful ideas that go beyond the ordinary
	1 2	3 4	5
FUTURISTIC THINKING Utilizes knowledge of future trends and predictions as related to the Future Scene	Includes minimal or unrelated evidence of trends or technology	Some evidence of futuristic ideas; goes beyond the norms at times	Integrates purposeful, futuristic concepts, showing how ideas impact the future
	1 2	3 4	5

NOTES:

- ✓ If no work is submitted for the step, a score of 0 will be given for Research Applied, Creative Strength, and Futuristic Thinking.
- ✓ If no student response is provided, the entire step receives 0 points.

Determining Scores

After all submitted work has been scored, all points earned in each Step are added to determine the total score of the booklet. Raw scores may be used in conjunction with Ranks, Quality Terms, and other processes to determine advancing booklets and/or final placement for awards.